

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 The present higher education landscape	1
1.2 The national higher education policy environment	2
1.3 Trends and reforms in the funding and management of higher education	6
1.4 Private and public benefits accruing from higher education	7
1.4.1 Theoretical background	7
1.4.2 Profitability of investment in education and the levying of fees	10
1.5 Public and private fees in higher education	14
1.5.1 The international experience	14
1.5.2 Educational support practices in selective countries	16
1.6 Sources of data	18
1.6.1 SAPSE database	18
1.6.2 HEMIS database	19
1.6.3 Other sources of data	20
1.7 Trends in student enrolment	20
1.7.1 Universities	20
1.7.2 Technikons	22
1.7.3 Distance education	23
1.7.4 Headcount of enrolled students	23
1.7.5 Higher education participation rate	25
1.7.6 FTE enrolled students	27
1.8 Outline of report	31
SECTION 2: SOURCES OF HIGHER EDUCATION FUNDING	33
2.1 The evolution of formulas for the subsidising of South African higher education institutions by the state	33
2.1.1 A public funding classification scheme	33
2.1.2 Benefits of state subsidisation of HE institutions by means of a formula	34
2.1.3 The funding mechanisms for universities and technikons since 1951	35
2.1.4 The Holloway formula (1953)	36
2.1.5 The Van Wyk de Vries formula (1977)	36
2.1.6 The SAPSE formula for universities (1984)	38
2.1.7 Revised SAPSE subsidy formula for universities (1993)	41
2.1.8 The SAPSE subsidy formula for technikons (1987)	41
2.1.9 Revised SAPSE subsidy formula for technikons (1993)	42
2.1.10 Earmarked funding during 1984 to 2003	43

2.1.11	The funding of teacher training colleges	44
2.1.12	Public funding of land, buildings and land improvements other than buildings at HE institutions since 1951	44
2.2	The New Funding Framework (NFF) for public higher education	48
2.2.1	Background	48
2.2.2	The implications and structure of the NFF	50
2.2.3	A critical analysis of the NFF	55
2.2.4	Subsidy formulas for HE in South Africa classified according to Jongbloed's two dimensions	58
2.3	Tuition fees and bad debt	59
2.4	The National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS)	63
2.4.1	Background	63
2.4.2	The effect of NSFAS on higher education in South Africa	66
2.4.3	Lessons to be learned from the income-contingent loan scheme of the United Kingdom	71
2.5	The third money stream	72
2.5.1	Philanthropic funding	73
2.5.2	Entrepreneurial funding	74
2.5.3	Earmarked research allocations	75
2.5.4	Trends in state earmarked research funding to HE Institutions (1996-2003)	75

SECTION 3: THE ANALYSIS OF FINANCIAL STATEMENTS OF HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS **83**

3.1	Introduction	83
3.1.1	Sources of information	83
3.1.2	Incomplete information	84
3.1.3	Information on the auxiliary enterprises programme (student and staff accommodation)	86
3.1.4	NSFAS allocations	86
3.1.5	Depreciation and the effect of provisions under GAAP based accounting versus cash based accounting in SAPSE	86
3.1.6	Remuneration of personnel	86
3.1.7	The third money stream	87
3.1.8	Erroneous financial information	87
3.2	Relative state spending on higher education: Some macro-economic indicators	87
3.3	Trends in the composition of institutional income	92

3.4	Different income categories per unit of input	95
3.5	Analysis of the expenditure of HE institutions	100
3.5.1	Recurrent expenditure per weighted FTE student	100
3.5.2	Recurrent expenditure per qualification awarded	102
3.5.3	Bursaries paid by HE institutions	104
3.6	Trends in the remuneration of HE personnel	106
3.7	Expenditure on library collections	116
3.8	HE institutions experiencing financial problems	117

SECTION 4: ANALYSIS OF THE TEACHING AND RESEARCH PERFORMANCE OF HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS 119

4.1	Performance indicators of HE institutions	119
4.2	Student-lecturer ratio	120
4.3	Qualifications awarded per lecturer	123
4.4	Graduation rates	127
4.5	Indicators measuring research output	131
4.6	How did the HE institutions perform in respect of teaching and research during 1986 to 2003?	134

SECTION 5: FUTURE STATE FUNDING OF HIGHER EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA: SOME SCENARIOS 137

5.1	Introduction	137
5.2	Senior Certificate (SC) results for 1996-2003	137
5.3	How will the number of candidates completing senior secondary education influence higher education numbers during the next decade?	140
5.4	Other factors that will influence higher education enrolment numbers in the next decade	142
5.5	The macro economic scene for the next 5 years	145
5.6	Scenarios of government funding of higher education	149
5.6.1	Government allocations keep tract with size of GDP	150
5.6.2	Real government allocations keep tract with increases in student numbers	152

SECTION 6: CONCLUSIONS AND PROPOSALS	159
6.1 Introduction	159
6.2 Changing sources of funding of HE institutions	160
6.2.1 Relative public funding of HE	160
6.2.2 The three income streams in HE expressed per weighted FTE student	160
6.3 Trends in institutional expenditure	162
6.3.1 Real recurrent HE expenditure per weighted FTE student and per qualification awarded	162
6.3.2 Remuneration of HE personnel	163
6.3.3 Financial viability of HE institutions	166
6.4 The performance of the HE system	167
6.4.1 Teaching performance	167
6.4.2 Research performance	168
6.5 Some other issues related to funding	169
6.5.1 HE policy framework	169
6.5.2 State provision for new buildings	171
6.5.3 Jongbloed's two dimensional classification of HE funding systems	171
6.5.4 The principle of cost-sharing in HE	172
6.5.5 Student debt	172
6.5.6 The impact and working of the NSFAS scheme	172
6.5.7 Personnel and financial reporting of HE institutions	173
6.5.8 Trends in earmarked research funding by the state	174
6.5.9 Future state funding of HE in South Africa	175
SECTION 7: BIBLIOGRAPHY	175

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Rate of return of investment in education	10
Table 1.2	Headcount of students according to year and sector: 1910-2003	24
Table 1.3	Headcount growth rates of students in higher education: 1910-2003	25
Table 2.1	Weighting factors for teaching inputs: 2004/05 to 2006/07	51
Table 2.2	Funding groups 2004/05 to 2006/07	52
Table 2.3	Weighting factors for teaching outputs	53
Table 2.4	Graduation benchmarks for contact and distance programmes	53
Table 2.5	The size of accumulated student debt of HAU's in South Africa: 2000-2003 (in Rand)	60
Table 2.6	The size of accumulated student debt of 6 HDUs in South Africa: 2000-2003 (in Rand)	61
Table 2.7	The size of accumulated student debt of 6 HAT's in South Africa: 2000-2003 (in Rand)	61
Table 2.8	The size of accumulated student debt of 3 HDI's in South Africa: 2000-2003 (in Rand)	62
Table 2.9	NSFAS allocations at HAU's: 1995-2003 (in Rand)	67
Table 2.10	NSFAS allocations at HDUs: 1995-2003 (in Rand)	68
Table 2.11	NSFAS allocations at HAT's: 1995-2003 (in Rand)	69
Table 2.12	NSFAS allocations at HDI's: 1995-2003 (in Rand)	70
Table 2.13	Project research allocations (in Rand) by WRC in 2004 according to key research areas (KSA) and research sector	77
Table 3.1	Relative state allocations to universities and technikons: 1987-2005	89
Table 3.2	Total expenditure on HE by government as a percentage of the GDP for 2001 according to continent/region	91
Table 3.3	Bursaries (in Rand) paid by HE institutions in South Africa: 1996-2003	105
Table 4.1	Ratio of students to teaching staff (FTE) in higher education: 1985-1992 according to country	123
Table 4.2	Weighted NPHE graduation benchmarks for 2003 according to mode of instruction	130
Table 5.1	Results of Senior Certificate examination according to type of pass: 1996-2003	137
Table 5.2	Comparison between the growth in the population in age bracket 18-20 years and Senior Certificate results: 1996-2003 (Index values with 1996 = 100)	138

Table 5.3	Enrolment of first time entering pre-diplomate and undergraduate students at universities and technikons: 2000-2003	141
Table 5.4	Estimates of certain South African economic indicators: 2003-2007	146
Table 5.5	Expenditure on Gross Domestic Product and its components in South Africa: 2002-2010 (R billion in 1995 prices)	148
Table 5.6	Public expenditure on higher education: Different scenarios for 2006-2010 using HE expenditure as percentage of GDP as yardstick (R millions)	150
Table 5.7	CPI inflation and public HE allocations per WFTES for 2003 and estimated per WFTES allocations for 2004-2010 in order for the allocations to will stay constant in real terms	153
Table 5.8	State HE allocations in nominal and real terms for different growth rates in WFTES on the assumption that the real state HE allocations per WFTES will stay constant for 2003-2010 (R millions)	154
Table 6.1	Real tuition fees per WFTES and real state appropriations per WFTES according to HE group and year (in constant 2000 prices)	161
Table 6.2	Real recurrent expenditure per WFTES and qualification awarded according to HE group and year (in constant 2000 prices)	163
Table 6.3	Weighted FTE enrolled students, FTE instruction/research personnel numbers and FTE 'Other personnel' numbers according to institutional group and year	164
Table 6.4	Average remuneration of VCs and all personnel in 2003 according to institutional group	165
Table 6.5	The size of accumulated student debt at 26 HEIs (all HAU's, 6 HDUs, 6 HATs and 3 HDTs) according to year	172
Table 6.6	NSFAS allocations at HE institutions in South Africa	173

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	Expenditure on higher education per student in OECD countries	14
Figure 1.2	Expenditure on higher education as percentage of GDP	15
Figure 1.3	Share of private expenditure in relation to total expenditure at higher education institutions in OECD countries	15
Figure 1.4	Public financial assistance to students in England	17
Figure 1.5	Headcount growth in higher education according to year and sector	26
Figure 1.6	FTE enrolled students at universities according to institutional group and year	28
Figure 1.7	FTE enrolled students at technikons according to institutional group and year	28
Figure 1.8:	FTE enrolled students at universities according to mode of instruction and year	30
Figure 1.9:	FTE enrolled students at technikons according to mode of instruction and year	31
Figure 2.1	Two dimensional positioning of HE funding schemes	33
Figure 2.2	The system of government steering of the public higher education system	50
Figure 2.3	Two dimensional positioning of HE funding formulas according to Jongbloed's scheme	59
Figure 2.4	Earmarked research allocations (in Rand) by state agencies to universities (excluding WRC allocations) for 1996-2003 according to institutional group	78
Figure 2.5	Earmarked research allocations (in Rand) by state agencies to technikons (excluding WRC allocations) for 1996-2003 according to institutional group	79
Figure 2.6	Real earmarked research allocations (in Rand) per FTE instruction/research personnel member by state agencies to universities (excluding WRC allocations) for 1996-2003 according to institutional group	80
Figure 2.7	Real earmarked research allocations (in Rand) per FTE instruction/research personnel member by state agencies to technikons (excluding WRC allocations) for 1996-2003 according to institutional group	81
Figure 3.1	Relative expenditure on universities and technikons: 1987-2005	90
Figure 3.2	Composition of income of historically advantaged universities according to source of income and year	93
Figure 3.3	Composition of income of historically disadvantaged universities according to source of income and year	93
Figure 3.4	Composition of income of historically advantaged technikons according to source of income and year	94

Figure 3.5	Composition of income of historically disadvantaged technikons according to source of income and year	95
Figure 3.6	Real income per weighted FTE student for historically advantaged universities according to source of income: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	96
Figure 3.7	Real income per weighted FTE student for historically disadvantaged universities according to source of income: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	97
Figure 3.8	Real income per weighted FTE student for historically advantaged technikons according to source of income: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	97
Figure 3.9	Real income per weighted FTE student for historically disadvantaged technikons according to source of income: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	98
Figure 3.10	Real income from third money stream per FTE instruction/research personnel member for historically advantaged universities and technikons according to group: 1986-2003 (excluding 1999) [constant 2000 prices]	99
Figure 3.11	Real recurrent expenditure per WFTES at HAU and HDUs: 1987-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	100
Figure 3.12	Real recurrent expenditure per WFTES at HAT and HDTs: 1987-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	101
Figure 3.13	Real recurrent expenditure per qualification awarded at HAU and HDUs : 1987-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	103
Figure 3.14	Real recurrent expenditure per qualification awarded at HAT and HDTs : 1987-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	103
Figure 3.15	Personnel expenditure as percentage of total recurrent expenditure according to HE group: 1987, 1994, 1998 and 2003	106
Figure 3.16	Real remuneration per FTE personnel member for the historically advantaged universities according to personnel category: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	107
Figure 3.17	Real remuneration per FTE personnel member for the historically disadvantaged universities according to personnel category: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	108
Figure 3.18	Real remuneration per FTE personnel member for the historically advantaged technikons according to personnel category: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	109

Figure 3.19	Real remuneration per FTE personnel member for the historically disadvantaged technikons according to personnel category: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	109
Table 3.20	Real remuneration per FTE instruction/research personnel member for the five largest research universities: 1986-2003 (constant 2000 prices)	111
Figure 3.21	Average remuneration of Vice Chancellors according to year and HE sector (R'000)	112
Figure 3.22	Real remuneration per personnel member according to group: 1992-2002 (constant 2000 prices)	115
Figure 3.23	Real expenditure on library collections per WFTES according to institutional group: 1986-1998 (constant 2000 prices)	116
Figure 3.24	Total deficits - all activities (as per income statement) for universities and technikons: 2000-2003 (R'000)	117
Figure 4.1	WFTES per FTE instruction/research personnel member (S/L ratio) for universities: 1986-2003	121
Figure 4.2	WFTES per FTE instruction/research personnel member (S/L ratio) for technikons: 1986-2003	122
Figure 4.3	Number of qualifications awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member (Q/L ratio) for universities: 1986-2003	125
Figure 4.4	Number of masters degrees awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member (M/L ratio) for universities: 1986-2003	125
Figure 4.5	Total number of qualifications awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member (Q/L ratio) at technikons: 1986-2003	126
Figure 4.6	Number of National Diplomas (3y) awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member (3YD/L ratio) at technikons: 1986-2003	126
Figure 4.7	Graduation rates (headcount) for universities: 1986-2003	129
Figure 4.8	Graduation rates (headcount) for technikons: 1986-2003	129
Figure 4.9	Publication units per FTE instruction/research personnel member for universities: 1993-2003	132
Figure 4.10	Publication units per FTE instruction/research personnel member for technikons: 1993-2003	133
Figure 4.11	Number of doctoral degrees awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member for universities: 1986-2003	134
Figure 5.1	Results of Senior Certificate examination: 1996-2003	138
Figure 5.2	State allocation per WFTES according to year (constant 2003 prices)	152

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A	183	
Table A.1	Headcount of students in HE sector 1986-2003 according to institution and year	184
Table A.2	FTE enrolled students in HE sector 1986-2003 according to institution and year	185
Table A.3	FTE enrolled contact students in HE sector 1986-2003 according to institution and year	186
Table A.4	FTE enrolled distance students in HE sector 1986-2003 according to institution and year	187
Table A.5	Weighted FTE enrolled students in HE sector 1986-2003 according to institution and year	188
APPENDIX B	189	
Table B.1	a-Values of state subsidy allocations to HE institutions for the years 1986-2003 according to institution and year	190
Table B.2	Backlogs/Surpluses in cost-units for new buildings and other land improvements for HE institutions according to institution, programme and year	191
Table B.3	THRIP allocations (R) to HE institutions during 1995-2004 according to institution and year	192
Table B.4	Allocations (R) from the innovation fund to HE institutions during 1996-2004 according to institution and year	193
Table B.5	NRF allocations (R) (excluding THRIP and innovation fund) to HE institutions during 1996-2004 according to institution and year	194
Table B.6	MRC allocations (R) to HE institutions during 1996-2003 according to institution and year	195
Table B.7	Total earmarked research allocations (R) from state agencies to HE institutions during 1996-2003 according to institution and year	196
APPENDIX C	197	
Table C.1.1	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Cape Town	198
Table C.1.2	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Durban Westville	199
Table C.1.3	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Fort Hare	200
Table C.1.4	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Medical University of South Africa	201

Table C.1.5	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Natal	202
Table C.1.6	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of the North	203
Table C.1.7	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Free State University	204
Table C.1.8	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Port Elizabeth	205
Table C.1.9	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Potchefstroom University for CHE	206
Table C.1.10	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Pretoria	207
Table C.1.11	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Rand Afrikaans University	208
Table C.1.12	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Rhodes University	209
Table C.1.13	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of South Africa	210
Table C.1.14	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Stellenbosch	211
Table C.1.15	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Western Cape	212
Table C.1.16	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Witwatersrand University	213
Table C.1.17	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Zululand	214
Table C.1.18	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Vista	215
Table C.1.19	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Transkei	216
Table C.1.20	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of North West University	217
Table C.1.21	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of University of Venda	218
Table C.1.22	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Historically Advantaged Universities	219
Table C.1.23	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Historically Disadvantaged Universities	220
Table C.2.1	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Cape Technikon	221
Table C.2.2	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Northern Gauteng	222
Table C.2.3	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Mangosotho	223
Table C.2.4	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon ML Sultan	224
Table C.2.5	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Natal	225
Table C.2.6	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Free State	226
Table C.2.7	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Peninsula Technikon	227
Table C.2.8	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Port Elizabeth	228
Table C.2.9	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Pretoria	229
Table C.2.10	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon South Africa	230
Table C.2.11	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Vaal Triangle	231
Table C.2.12	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Witwatersrand	232
Table C.2.13	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Border	233
Table C.2.14	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon North West	234
Table C.2.15	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Technikon Eastern Cape	235

Table C.2.16	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Durban Institute of Technology	236
Table C.2.17	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Historically Advantaged Technikons	237
Table C.2.18	Income, expenditure and selected indicators of Historically Disadvantaged Technikons	238
Table C.3.1	Remuneration (R'000) of vice-chancellors for 2001-2003 according to institution and year	239
Table C.3.2	Surplus/deficits – all activities (R'000 as per income statement) for 2000-2003 according to institution and year	240
APPENDIX D		241
Table D.1	FTE personnel in the HE sector 1986-2003 according to institution, personnel category and year	242
Table D.2	Weighted FTE students per FTE instruction/research personnel member in the HE sector for 1986-2003 according to institution and year	244
Table D.3	Degrees/Diplomas/Certificates awarded at universities in 1986-2003 according to institution, type of qualification and year	245
Table D.4	Degrees/Diplomas/Certificates awarded at technikons in 1986-2003 according to institution, type of qualification and year	247
Table D.5	Degrees/Diplomas/Certificates awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member at universities in 1986-2003 according to institution, type of qualification and year	248
Table D.6	Qualifications awarded per FTE instruction/research personnel member for the technikon sector in 1986-2003 according to institution, type of qualification and year	250
Table D.7	Graduation rates for universities for 1986-2003 according to institution and year	251
Table D.8	Graduation rates for technikons for 1986-2003 according to institution and year	252
Table D.9	Personnel with permanent appointments in the HE sector in 1986-2003 according to institution, personnel category and year	253
Table D.10	Research output of universities and technikons for 1993-2003 according to institution and year	255
Table D.11	Publication units per FTE instruction/research personnel member of universities and technikons for 1993-2003 according to institution and year	256
Table D.12	Publication units per permanently appointed instruction/research personnel member of universities and technikons for 1993-2003 according to institution and year	257